Independent Task Force Report No. 76

## The Work Ahead

Machines, Skills, and U.S. Leadership in the Twenty-First Century

John Engler and Penny Pritzker, *Chairs* Edward Alden, *Project Director* Laura Taylor-Kale, *Deputy Project Director* 

## **ENDNOTES**

- Bureau of Labor Statistics, "Labor Force Statistics From Current Population Survey: 1. Databases, Tables and Calculators by Subject," February 16, 2018, http://data.bls.gov /timeseries/LNS11300000. See also Arne L. Kalleberg and Till M. von Wachter, "The U.S. Labor Market During and After the Great Recession: Continuities and Transformations," RSF: The Russell Sage Foundation Journal of the Social Sciences 3, no. 3 (April 2017): 1-19, http://rsfjournal.org/doi/full/10.7758/RSF.2017.3.3.01; Sandra E. Black, Diane Whitmore Schanzenbach, and Audrey Breitwieser, "The Recent Decline in Women's Labor Force Participation," Hamilton Project, October 2017, http:// hamiltonproject.org/assets/files/decline\_womens\_labor\_force\_participation\_ BlackSchanzenbach.pdf. While labor force participation did fall more steeply during the recession, there has been a reasonably steady decline since 2000 driven by rising retirements and declining work among prime-age men. See Alan B. Krueger, "Where Have All the Workers Gone? An Inquiry Into the Decline in the U.S. Labor Force Participation Rate," Brookings Papers on Economic Activity, September 2017, http:// brookings.edu/bpea-articles/where-have-all-the-workers-gone-an-inquiry-into-the -decline-of-the-u-s-labor-force-participation-rate.
- Annie Lowrey, "The Great Recession Is Still With Us," Atlantic, December 1, 2017, http://theatlantic.com/business/archive/2017/12/great-recession-still-with-us/547268.
- 3. David Autor, David Dorn, Gordon Hanson, and Kaveh Majlesi, "Importing Political Polarization? The Electoral Consequences of Rising Trade Exposure," December 2017, http://ddorn.net/papers/ADHM-PoliticalPolarization.pdf; Italo Colantone and Piero Stanig, "The Trade Origins of Economic Nationalism: Import Competition and Voting Behavior in Western Europe," January 21, 2017, http://bancaditalia.it/pubblicazioni /altri-atti-seminari/2016/14\_novembre\_Colantone\_Stanig.pdf; Monica Anderson, "6 Key Findings on How Americans See the Rise of Automation," Pew Research Center, October 4, 2017, http://pewresearch.org/fact-tank/2017/10/04/6-key-findings -on-how-americans-see-the-rise-of-automation.
- Jay Shambaugh et al., Thirteen Facts About Wage Growth, Hamilton Project, 2017, http://hamiltonproject.org/assets/files/thirteen\_facts\_wage\_growth.pdf.
- "A Look at Pay at the Top, the Bottom, and In Between," Bureau of Labor Statistics, May 2015, http://www.bls.gov/spotlight/2015/a-look-at-pay-at-the-top-the-bottom-and-in

109

- -between/pdf/a-look-at-pay-at-the-top-the-bottom-and-in-between.pdf.
- Raj Chetty et al., "The Fading American Dream: Trends in Absolute Income Mobility Since 1940" (NBER Working Paper no. 22910, March 2017), http://nber.org/papers/w22910.
- 7. James Manyika et al., *The US Economy: An Agenda for Inclusive Growth*, McKinsey Global Institute, November 2016, 6.
- 8. Edward Alden and Rebecca Strauss, *How America Stacks Up: Economic Competitiveness and U.S. Policy* (New York: Council on Foreign Relations, 2016).
- James Manyika et al., Jobs Lost, Jobs Gained: Workforce Transitions in a Time of Automation, McKinsey Global Institute, December 2017, http://mckinsey.com/mgi /overview/2017-in-review/automation-and-the-future-of-work/jobs-lost-jobs-gained -workforce-transitions-in-a-time-of-automation.
- Christoph Lakner and Branko Milanovic, "Global Income Distribution: From the Fall
  of the Berlin Wall to the Great Recession" (The World Bank Policy Research Working
  Paper no. 6719, December 2013), http://documents.worldbank.org/curated
  /en/914431468162277879/pdf/WPS6719.pdf.
- 11. David H. Autor, David Dorn, and Gordon H. Hanson, "The China Shock: Learning From Labor Market Adjustment to Large Changes in Trade" (NBER Working Paper no. 21906, January 2016), http://nber.org/papers/w21906; Lawrence Edwards and Robert Z. Lawrence, Rising Tide: Is Growth in Emerging Economies Good for the United States? (Washington, DC: Peterson Institute for International Economics, 2013); Adams Nager, "Trade vs. Productivity: What Caused U.S. Manufacturing's Decline and How to Revive It," Information Technology & Innovation Foundation, February 2017, http://www2.itif.org/2017-trade-vs-productivity.pdf.
- 12. Arun Sundarajan, "The Future of Work: The Digital Economy Will Sharply Erode the Traditional Employer-Employee Relationship," *Finance & Development* 54, no. 2 (June 2017).
- Dick M. Carpenter II et al., License to Work: A National Study of Burdens from Occupational Licensing (Arlington, VA: Institute for Justice, 2017), http://ii.org/wp-content/themes/ijorg/images/ltw2/License\_to\_Work\_2nd\_Edition.pdf.
- Mark Muro et al., Digitalization and the American Workforce (Washington, DC: Brookings Institution, 2017), http://brookings.edu/wp-content/uploads/2017/11 /mpp\_2017nov15\_digitalization\_full\_report.pdf.
- Carl Benedikt Frey and Michael A. Osborne, "The Future of Employment: How Susceptible Are Jobs to Computerisation?," Oxford Martin Programme on Technology and Employment, September 2013, http://oxfordmartin.ox.ac.uk/downloads/academic/future-of-employment.pdf.
- Manyika et al., Jobs Lost, Jobs Gained; James Manyika, "Technology, Jobs, and the Future of Work," McKinsey Global Institute, May 2017, http://mckinsey.com/global-themes/employment-and-growth/technology-jobs-and-the-future-of-work.
- White House, "Artificial Intelligence, Automation, and the Economy," U.S. Council of Economic Advisers, December 2016, http://whitehouse.gov/sites/whitehouse.gov/files/images/EMBARGOED%20AI%20Economy%20Report.pdf.

110 — Endnotes — — — —
------------------------

- Federal Reserve, "Record of Meeting: Community Advisory Council and Board of Governors," November 3, 2017, http://federalreserve.gov/aboutthefed/files/cac -20171103.pdf.
- Spencer Overton, "The Impact of Automation on Black Jobs" (data compiled for *The Future of Work* CBCF ALC Issue Forum, September 23, 2017), http://jointcenter.org/sites/default/files/The%20Impact%20of%20Automation%20on%20Black%20 Jobs%20CBC%20ALC%2011-14-17.pdf.
- Michael Chui, James Manyika, and Mehdi Miremadi, "Four Fundamentals of Workplace Automation," McKinsey Quarterly, November 2015, http://mckinsey.com /business-functions/digital-mckinsey/our-insights/four-fundamentals-of -workplace-automation.
- Bureau of Labor Statistics, "Web Developers," Occupational Outlook Handbook, http://bls.gov/ooh/computer-and-information-technology/web-developers.htm.
- James Bessen, "How Computer Automation Affects Occupations: Technology, Jobs, and Skills," Vox, September 22, 2016, http://voxeu.org/article/ how-computer-automation-affects-occupations.
- 23. Economists Laura Tyson and Michael Spence write: "Historical experience indicates that as technology has increased human productivity, the result has been net job creation, not net job destruction. In the past, with a lag and with painful adjustment costs for dislocated workers whose jobs have disappeared, technological progress has fostered growth in demand for new goods and services, and this has increased demand for labor and more than offset the labor-substituting effects of such progress." They also note that "the future outlook, however, is uncertain," and that job losses could be deeper and more lasting than in previous technological revolutions. "Exploring the Effects of Technology on Income and Wealth Inequality," in After Piketty: The Agenda for Economics and Inequality, ed. Heather Boushey, J. Bradford DeLong, and Marshall Steinbaum (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2017).
- OECD Employment Outlook 2017 (Paris: OECD Publishing, 2017), http://www.oecd.org/els/oecd-employment-outlook-19991266.htm.
- Burning Glass Technologies and Capitol One, "Crunched by the Numbers: The Digital Skills Gap in the Workforce," March 2015, http://burning-glass.com/wp-content /uploads/2015/06/Digital\_Skills\_Gap.pdf.
- 26. Sundarajan, "The Future of Work."
- 27. Manyika et al., Jobs Lost, Jobs Gained.
- 28. Klaus Schwab, The Fourth Industrial Revolution (New York: Crown Books, 2017).
- John Maynard Keynes, "Economic Possibilities for Our Grandchildren," in Essays in Persuasion (New York: W. W. Norton, 1963), 358–373, http://www.econ.yale.edu /smith/econ116a/keynes1.pdf.
- National Commission on Technology, Automation and Economic Progress, *Technology and the American Economy Volume* 1, Y3.T22-2T22 (Washington DC: GPO, 1966), http://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED023803.pdf.
- 31. Keith Bradsher and Paul Mozur, "China's Plan to Build Its Own High-Tech Industries Worries Western Businesses," *New York Times*, March 7, 2017, http://nytimes

 Endnotes	 11	[ ]	l
Limitotes	1.1	Ł.	

- .com/2017/03/07/business/china-trade-manufacturing-europe.html; Keith Bradsher, "China Hastens the World Toward an Electric-Car Future," New York Times, October 9, 2017, http://nytimes.com/2017/10/09/business/china-hastens-the-world-toward-an-electric-car-future.html.
- Mike Henry, "US R&D Spending at All-Time High, Federal Share Reaches Record Low," American Institute of Physics, November 8, 2016, http://aip.org/fyi/2016 /us-rd-spending-all-time-high-federal-share-reaches-record-low.
- 33. Alden and Strauss, How America Stacks Up.
- 34. R&D Budget and Policy Program, "Historical Trends in Federal R&D," American Association for the Advancement of Science, http://aaas.org/page/historical-trends-federal-rd.
- Donald J. Boyd, Public Research Universities: Changes in State Funding (Cambridge, MA: American Academy of Arts and Sciences, 2015), http://amacad.org/multimedia/pdfs/publications/researchpapersmonographs/PublicResearchUniv\_ChangesInStateFunding.pdf.
- Charles W. Wessner and Alan Wolff, Rising to the Challenge: U.S. Innovation Policy for the Global Economy (Washington, DC: National Research Council, 2012); Office of the U.S. Trade Representative, "USTR Announces Section 301 Investigation of China," http://ustr.gov/about-us/policy-offices/press-office/press-releases/2017/august /ustr-announces-initiation-section.
- The Commission on the Theft of American Intellectual Property, "The IP Commission Report," The National Bureau of Asian Research, 2013, http://ipcommission.org /report/ip\_commission\_report\_052213.pdf.
- 38. Aaron Smith and Monica Anderson, "Automation in Everyday Life," Pew Research Center, October 4, 2017, http://pewinternet.org/2017/10/04 /automation-in-everyday-life.
- "European Parliament Calls for Robot Law, Rejects Robot Tax," Reuters, February 16, 2017, http://reuters.com/article/us-europe-robots-lawmaking /european-parliament-calls-for-robot-law-rejects-robot-tax-idUSKBN15V2KM.
- 40. James Manyika et al., "Digital America: A Tale of the Haves and Have-Mores," McKinsey Global Institute, December 2015, http://mckinsey.com/industries/high-tech/our-insights/digital-america-a-tale-of-the-haves-and-have-mores.
- 41. Jeb Bush, Thomas F. McLarty, and Edward Alden, *U.S. Immigration Policy*, Independent Task Force Report no. 63 (New York: Council on Foreign Relations), 2009.
- 42. Stephanie Saul, "As Flow of Foreign Students Wanes, U.S. Universities Feel the Sting," *New York Times*, January 2, 2018, http://nytimes.com/2018/01/02/us/international -enrollment-drop.html; Stuart Anderson, "Here's What to Expect on Immigration in 2018," *Forbes*, January 2, 2018, http://forbes.com/sites/stuartanderson/2018/01/02 /heres-what-to-expect-on-immigration-in-2018/2.
- 43. "China Eases Visa Permits for Foreign High-Skilled Workers," *Xinhua*, January 4, 2018, http://xinhuanet.com/english/2018-01/04/c\_136872071.htm.
- 44. Ian Hathaway and Robert E. Litan, *Declining Business Dynamism in the United States:*A Look at States and Metros, Brookings Institution, May 2014, http://brookings.edu

- /research/declining-business-dynamism-in-the-united-states-a-look-at-states-and -metros; Michael J. Coren, "The Number of New Business in the US Is Falling Off a Cliff," Quartz, May 24, 2016, http://qz.com/690881/the-number-of-new-businesses -in-the-us-is-falling-off-a-cliff.
- 45. Geoff Colvin, "The Surprising Slowdown in Startups," Fortune, May 18, 2016, http://fortune.com/2016/03/18/startup-growth-stagnation.
- Jim Tankersley, "A Very Bad Sign for All but America's Biggest Cities," Washington Post, May 22, 2016, http://washingtonpost.com/news/wonk /wp/2016/05/22/a-very-bad-sign-for-all-but-americas-biggest-cities.
- 47. Jay Shambaugh et al., Thirteen Facts About Wage Growth.
- 48. Jay Shambaugh and Ryan Nunn, "Why Wages Aren't Growing in America," *Harvard Business Review*, October 24, 2017, http://hbr.org/2017/10/why-wages-arent-growing-in-america.
- 49. Shambaugh et al., Thirteen Facts About Wage Growth.
- OECD Employment Outlook 2017; International Labor Organization and the Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development, "The Labour Share in G20 Economies," February 2015, http://oecd.org/g20/topics/employment-and-social -policy/The-Labour-Share-in-G20-Economies.pdf.
- 51. Jared Bernstein, "What's the Matter With Wages? Exploring Wage Stagnation and the American Worker" (presentation at the Brookings Institution, September 26, 2017), http://hamiltonproject.org/events/whats\_the\_matter\_with\_wages\_exploring\_wage\_ stagnation\_and\_the\_american\_work.
- 52. Bureau of Labor Statistics, "Alternative Measures of Labor Underutilization," Economic News Release, http://www.bls.gov/news.release/empsit.t15.htm. The Federal Reserve recently noted that barriers to economic stability continue to disproportionately affect people of color and disabled workers; unemployment among African Americans was nearly 8 percent and among persons with a disability 10.5 percent in 2016.
- Shambaugh et al., Thirteen Facts About Wage Growth; Steve Levine, "Good News: Inequality Shrinking," Axios, December 6, 2017, http://axios.com/the-shrinking-of-inequality-2515429929.html.
- 54. Larger forces may be at work as well: rising wage inequality and a growing share of the gains accruing to capital rather than labor appear to be characteristic of the early stages of eras of rapid technological change. Similar trends were evident in the early stages of the Industrial Revolution. As MGI has argued, times of economic disruption and transition can have painful consequences for many workers. In early Industrial Revolution Britain, wage growth stagnated for roughly the first half of the nineteenth century even as new investments in mechanical spinning, steam engines, and other technologies raised productivity sharply and the rate of company profits doubled. It was only after the middle part of the century—when capital investments reached a scale large enough to have absorbed the available labor supplies—that wage growth began to keep pace with, and eventually overtake, productivity growth. It remains to be seen whether our modern technological revolution will follow the same trend. See Robert C. Allen, "Engels' Pause: Technical Change, Capital Accumulation, and Inequality in the

Endnotes — 11
Endnotes ————

- British Industrial Revolution," Explorations in Economic History 46, no. 4 (October 2009).
- 55. Bureau of Labor Statistics, "Fastest Growing Occupations 2014-24," Economic News Release, http://www.bls.gov/news.release/ecopro.t05.htm.
- 56. Bureau of Labor Statistics, "Occupations With the Most Job Growth," Employment Projections, http://www.bls.gov/emp/ep\_table\_104.htm.
- 57. OECD Employment Outlook 2017, 29.
- 58. "Jobs for America's Graduates," http://jag.org; "Generation," http://generation.org.
- Sarah Holder, "America's Most and Least Distressed Cities," CityLab, September 25, 2016, http://citylab.com/equity/2017/09/distressed-communities/541044.
- 60. Robert J. Gordon, *The Rise and Fall of American Growth* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2016).
- Claudia Goldin, "America's Graduation From High School: The Evolution and Spread of Secondary Schooling in the Twentieth Century," *Journal of Economic History* 58, no. 2 (1998): 345–374.
- 62. There has been significant slippage compared with other countries over the last generation, however: Americans aged fifty-five to sixty-four still rank first worldwide in both high school and college completion; the generation aged twenty-five to thirty-four has fallen to twelfth in both rankings. The picture is especially troubling for young people from poorer households. Rebecca Strauss, "Schooling Ourselves in an Unequal America," *Opinionator* (blog), *New York Times*, June 26, 2013, http://opinionator.blogs.nytimes.com/author/rebecca-strauss.
- 63. Bureau of Labor Statistics, "Job Openings and Labor Turnover Summary," Economic News Release, http://www.bls.gov/news.release/jolts.nr0.htm.
- 64. See Rachael Stephens, "Mind the Gap: The State of Skills in the U.S.," Third Way, July 2017, http://thirdway.org/report/mind-the-gap-the-state-of-skills-in-the-us.
- 65. Joan Richardson et al., eds., "The PDK Poll of the Public's Attitudes Toward the Public Schools," *Kappan* magazine, September 2017, http://pdkpoll.org/results.
- 66. Tyson and Spence, "Exploring the Effects of Technology on Inequality."
- 67. Anthony P. Carnevale, Tanya I. Garcia, and Artem Gulish, "Career Pathways: Five Ways to Connect College and Careers," Georgetown University's Center on Education and the Workforce, 2017, http://cew.georgetown.edu/wp-content/uploads/LEE-final.pdf.
- Teresa Kroeger and Elise Gould, "The Class of 2017," Economic Policy Institute, 2017, http://epi.org/publication/the-class-of-2017.
- 69. "First Destinations for the College Class of 2016," National Association of Colleges and Employers, 2017, http://naceweb.org/uploadedfiles/files/2017/publication/report /first-destinations-for-the-college-class-of-2016.pdf.
- Burning Glass Technologies, "The Art of Employment: How Liberal Arts Graduates Can Improve Their Labor Market Prospects," 2013, http://burning-glass.com /wp-content/uploads/BGTReportLiberalArts.pdf.
- 71. Federal Reserve Bank of New York, "Center for Microeconomic Data: Student Debt,"

- 2017, http://newyorkfed.org/microeconomics/databank.html; Bipartisan Policy Center, "America's Student Debt Explosion: Understanding the Federal Government's Role," March 2017, http://bipartisanpolicy.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/03/BPC-Higher -Education-Americas-Student-Debt-Explosion.pdf.
- Anthony P. Carnevale et al., Good Jobs That Pay Without a BA (Washington, DC: Georgetown University's Center on Education and the Workforce, 2017), http://goodjobsdata.org/wp-content/uploads/Good-Jobs-wo-BA.pdf.
- 73. Harry J. Holzer and Sandy Baum, *Making College Work* (Washington, DC: Brookings Institution Press, 2017).
- Matt Sigelman, chief executive of Burning Glass Technologies, interview, November 22, 2017.
- 75. "Bridge the Gap: Rebuilding America's Middle Skills," Accenture, Burning Glass Technologies, and Harvard Business School, November 2014, http://hbs.edu/competitiveness/Documents/bridge-the-gap.pdf.
- 76. IBM, "Growing Digital Jobs and Advantage for Workers," IBM White Paper, 2017.
- 77. Robert Chiappetta, director of government affairs, Toyota Motor North America, interview, November 9, 2017.
- Stephanie Cronen, Meghan McQuiggan, and Emily Isenberg, "Adult Training and Education: Results From the National Household Education Survey's Program of 2016," National Center for Education Statistics and the U.S. Department of Education, September 2017, http://nces.ed.gov/pubs2017/2017103.pdf.
- National Skills Coalition, "Skills for Good Jobs: An Agenda for the Next President," November 2016, http://workforcedqc.org/sites/default/files/images/NSC%20 Skills%20for%20Good%20Jobs%20Agenda.pdf.
- Joseph B. Fuller and Matthew Sigelman, "Room to Grow: Identifying New Frontiers for Apprenticeships," Harvard Business School and Burning Glass Technologies, November 2017, http://hbs.edu/managing-the-future-of-work/Documents/room-to-grow.pdf.
- 81. White House Office of the Press Secretary, "Fact Sheet: Investing \$90 Million Through ApprenticeshipUSA to Expand Proven Pathways into the Middle Class," April 2016, http://obamawhitehouse.archives.gov/the-press-office/2016/04/21/fact-sheet -investing-90-million-through-apprenticeshipusa-expand-proven; Ian Kullgren and Marianne Levine, "Trump Signs Executive Order on Apprenticeships," *Politico*, June 15, 2017, http://politico.com/story/2017/06/15/trump-apprenticeship-executive-order-239590.
- "Using Labor Market Data to Improve Student Success," Aspen Institute, September 2016, http://aspeninstitute.org/publications/using-labor-market-data-improve -student-success.
- 83. Jason A. Tyszko, "Reinventing Employer Signaling in a Rapidly Changing Talent Marketplace," U.S. Chamber of Commerce Foundation, September 27, 2017, http://uschamberfoundation.org/blog/post/reinventing-employer-signaling-rapidly-changing-talent-marketplace.
- 84. Credential Engine, http://credentialengine.org.

- 85. Aneesh Chopra and Ethan Gurwitz, "Modernizing America's Workforce Data Architecture," Center for American Progress, August 15, 2017, http://americanprogress.org/issues/economy/reports/2017/08/15/437303/modernizing-americas-workforce-data-architecture.
- 86. The Obama administration tried to go a step further by enacting the so-called gainful employment regulations, which would have required vocational programs at for-profit higher education institutions as well as nondegree programs at community colleges to meet certain targets for the debt-to-income ratios of their graduates, or risk losing access to federal financial aid. The goal was to avoid saddling students with heavy debts to obtain certificates that did not lead to good jobs. The private colleges sued the Department of Education to block the rule, which has since been frozen by the Trump administration. See Katoe Reilly, "'We Will Keep Suing.' 17 States Slam Betsy DeVos for Blocking Rules on For-Profit Colleges," *Time*, October 18, 2017, http://time.com/4987630/state-lawsuit-betsy-devos-for-profit-college.
- 87. Aneesh Chopra, former U.S. chief technology officer, interview, October 31, 2017.
- 88. Susan Scrivener et al., "Doubling Graduation Rates: Three-Year Effects of CUNY's Accelerated Study in Associate Programs (ASAP) for Developmental Education Students," MDRC, 2015, http://mdrc.org/publication/doubling-graduation-rates; Thomas Bailey, Shanna Smith Jaggars, and Davis Jenkins, "What We Know About Guided Pathways," Community College Research Center, April 2015, http://ccrc.tc.columbia.edu/publications/what-we-know-about-guided-pathways-packet.html.
- 89. Byron Auguste, interview, November 15, 2017.
- 90. Journeys, http://informjourneys.com.
- John Donovan and Cathy Benko, "AT&T's Talent Overhaul," Harvard Business Review, October 2016.
- 92. "What Employers Can Do to Encourage Their Workers to Retrain," *Economist*, January 14, 2017, http://www.economist.com/news/special-report/21714171-companies-are -embracing-learning-core-skill-what-employers-can-do-encourage-their.
- Brad Stone, "Costco CEO Craig Jelinek Leads the Cheapest, Happiest Company in the World," Bloomberg BusinessWeek, June 7, 2013.
- 94. Michael Corkery, "At Walmart Academy, Training Better Managers. But With a Better Future?" *New York Times*, August 8, 2017, http://nytimes.com/2017/08/08/business /walmart-academy-employee-training.html.
- 95. "What You Need to Know About Amazon's New Career Choice Program," *TeachThought*, January 19, 2018, http://teachthought.com/current-events/what-you-need-to-know-about-amazons-new-career-choice-program.
- Amanda Bergson-Shilcock, "NSC's New Report Explores Role of Skill-Building for Service-Sector Workers," Skills (blog), National Skills Coalition, February 15, 2017, http://nationalskillscoalition.org/news/blog/nscs-new-report-explores-role-of-skill -building-for-service-sector-workers.
- 97. Kimberly Gilsdorf and Fay Hanleybrown, *Investing in Entry-Level Talent* (Reimagining Social Change, 2017), http://fsg.org/publications/investing-entry-level -talent#download-area; Neil Irwin, "How Did Walmart Get Cleaner Stores and Higher

- Sales? It Paid Its People More," New York Times, October 15, 2016, http://nytimes .com/2016/10/16/upshot/how-did-walmart-get-cleaner-stores-and-higher-sales-it-paid -its-people-more.html.
- "SkillsFuture," Government of Singapore, Ministry of Manpower, October 25, 2016, http://mom.gov.sg/employment-practices/skills-training-and-development/skillsfuture.
- 99. Rick McHugh and Will Kimball, "How Low Can We Go? State Unemployment Insurance Programs Exclude Record Numbers of Jobless Workers," Economic Policy Institute, Briefing Paper no. 392, March 9, 2015, http://epi.org/publication /how-low-can-we-go-state-unemployment-insurance-programs-exclude-record -numbers-of-jobless-workers.
- Conor McKay, Ethan Pollack, and Alistair Fitzpayne, Modernizing Unemployment Insurance for the Changing Nature of Work (Washington, DC: Aspen Institute Future of Work Initiative, January 2018).
- 101. Alden and Strauss, How America Stacks Up.
- 102. "Labor Force Participation Rate," OECD, May 29, 2017, http://data.oecd.org/emp/labour-force-participation-rate.htm.
- 103. Alden and Strauss, How America Stacks Up.
- 104. Ibid.
- 105. Amanda Bergson-Shilcock, "Congress Should Invest in Adult Basic Education," National Skills Coalition, March 3, 2016, http://nationalskillscoalition.org/resources/publications/file/Why-Congress-should-invest-in-adult-basic-education.pdf.
- 106. When the TAA program was created by President John F. Kennedy in 1962, many critics pointed out the illogic of providing special benefits for workers displaced by trade as opposed to those displaced due to technology or resource exhaustion, changing consumer preferences, or myriad other causes. But Kennedy argued that because trade liberalization was policy deliberately pursued by government, it was rightly seen as different. "When considerations of national policy make it desirable to avoid higher tariffs, those injured by that competition should not be required to bear the full brunt of the impacts," he said. Over time, TAA became part of the political bargain that persuaded some Democrats to support trade agreements. See the discussion in Edward Alden, Failure to Adjust: How Americans Got Left Behind in the Global Economy (Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield, 2017).
- 107. David H. Autor, David Dorn, and Gordon H. Hanson, "The China Syndrome: Local Labor Market Effects of Import Competition in the United States" (NBER Working Paper no. 18054, May 2012), http://nber.org/papers/w18054.
- 108. Wolters Kluwer Health: Lippincott Williams and Wilkins, "High Prevalence of Opioid Use by Social Security Disability Recipients," Science Daily, August 14, 2014, http:// sciencedaily.com/releases/2014/08/140814123612.htm.
- 109. "Back to Work Sweden: Improving the Re-Employment Prospects of Displaced Workers, Executive Summary," OECD, 2015, http://oecd.org/employment/emp/Sweden-BTW-DocsPress-ENG.pdf.
- 110. Alden and Strauss, How America Stacks Up.

- 111. OECD Employment Outlook 2017.
- 112. Heather Long, "There Are 7 Million Unemployed and 6.2 Million Job Openings. What's the Problem?" Washington Post, August 8, 2017, http://washingtonpost.com/news/wonk/wp/2017/08/08/there-are-7-million-unemployed-and-6-2-million-job-openings-whats-the-problem.
- 113. David Ihrke, "United States Mover Rate at a New Record Low," Census (blog), January 23, 2017, http://www.census.gov/newsroom/blogs/random-samplings/2017/01/mover-rate.html.
- 114. Ashley Pettus, "Immobile Labor," *Harvard* magazine, January–February 2013, http://harvardmagazine.com/2013/01/immobile-labor.
- 115. Jeffrey Lin, "Technological Adaptation, Cities, and the New Work" (Federal Reserve Bank of Philadelphia Working Paper no. 09-17, July 2009), http://philadelphiafed.org /-/media/research-and-data/publications/working-papers/2009/wp09-17.pdf.
- Rebecca Diamond, "The Determinants and Welfare Implications of US Workers' Diverging Location Choices by Skill: 1980–2000," *American Economic Review* 106, no. 3 (March 2016): 479–524, http://aeaweb.org/articles?id=10.1257/aer.20131706.
- 117. Compare with Jon Kamp, "Far From Boston, Faded Industrial Hubs Grasp for Growth," Wall Street Journal, August 8, 2017, http://wsj.com/articles/far-from-boston-faded -industrial-hub-grasps-for-growth-1502213302; see also Janet Adamy and Paul Overberg, "Struggling Americans Once Sought Greener Pastures—Now They're Stuck," Wall Street Journal, August 2, 2017, http://wsj.com/articles/struggling-americans-once-sought-greener-pasturesnow-theyre-stuck-1501686801.
- 118. Gillian B. White, "How Zoning Laws Exacerbate Inequality," Atlantic, November 23, 2015, http://theatlantic.com/business/archive/2015/11/zoning-laws-and-the-rise-of-economic-inequality/417360; Peter Ganong and Daniel W. Shoag, "Why Has Regional Income Convergence in the U.S. Declined?" (NBER Working Paper no. 23609, November 2017), http://nber.org/papers/w23609.
- Chang Tai-Hsieh and Enrico Moretti, "Housing Constraints and Spatial Misallocation" (NBER Working Paper no. 21154, May 2017), http://nber.org/papers/w21154.pdf.
- 120. Robert Collinson, Ingrid Gould Ellen, and Jens Ludwig, "Low-Income Housing Policy" (NBER Working Paper no. 21071, April 2015), http://nber.org/papers/w21071.pdf. The federal government spends about \$40 billion a year on various forms of support for low-income housing, primarily for renters; in comparison, the mortgage-interest deduction, which disproportionately benefits wealthier homeowners, costs the Treasury Department about \$190 billion annually.
- 121. Elizabeth Kneebone and Natalie Holmes, "The Growing Distance Between People and Jobs in Metropolitan America," Brookings Institution, March 2015, http://brookings .edu/research/the-growing-distance-between-people-and-jobs-in -metropolitan-america.
- 122. Matt Barnum, "The Certification Maze: Why Teachers Who Cross State Lines Can't Find Their Way Back to the Classroom," 74, February 15, 2017, http://the74million.org/article/the-certification-maze-why-teachers-who-cross-state-lines-cant-find-their-way-back-to-the-classroom.

118	 Endnotes	
118		

- 123. Dan Goldhaber et al., "Barriers to Cross-State Mobility in the Teaching Profession: Evidence From Oregon and Washington," Calder National Center for Analysis of Longitudinal Data in Education Research, October 2015, http://caldercenter.org/sites/default/files/WP%20143%20Policy%20Brief.pdf.
- 124. Janna E. Johnson and Morris M. Kleiner, "Is Occupational Licensing a Barrier to Interstate Migration?," Federal Reserve Bank of Minnesota, December 2017, http://minneapolisfed.org/research/sr/sr561.pdf.
- Morris M. Kleiner, "Reforming Occupational Licensing Policies," Brookings Institution, 2015, http://brookings.edu/wp-content/uploads/2016/06/THP\_ KleinerDiscPaper\_final.pdf.
- 126. Jaison R. Abel, Richard Deitz, and Yaqin Su, "Are Recent College Graduates Finding Good Jobs?" Current Issues in Economics and Finance 20, no. 1 (January 2014), http:// newyorkfed.org/medialibrary/media/research/current\_issues/ci20-1.pdf.
- 127. Joseph B. Fuller and Manjari Raman, "Dismissed by Degrees: How Degree Inflation Is Undermining U.S. Competitiveness and Hurting America's Middle Class," Accenture, Grads of Life, Harvard Business School, 2017, http://www.hbs.edu/managing-the -future-of-work/Documents/dismissed-by-degrees.pdf.
- 128. Burning Glass Technologies, "How Demand for a Bachelor's Degree Is Reshaping the Workforce," September 2014, http://burning-glass.com/wp-content/uploads/Moving\_the\_Goalposts.pdf.
- 129. Fuller and Raman, Dismissed by Degrees.
- 130. Manyika, "Technology, Jobs and the Future of Work."
- 131. Skills of Chicagoland's Future, "2016 Impact Report," May 2017, http://skillsforchicagolandsfuture.com/wp-content/uploads/2017/05/2016-Annual-Report\_Final\_web.pdf; see also Skills for Rhode Island's Future, http://skillsforri.com.
- 132. "Evaluation of a Demand Driven Workforce Solution," Skills for Chicagoland's Future Evaluation Project 2017, August 2017, http://skillsforchicagolandsfuture.com /wp-content/uploads/2017/10/2017-SCF-New-Growth-Report.pdf.
- White House, "TechHire Initiative," 2015, http://obamawhitehouse.archives.gov/node/325231.
- 134. Lawrence F. Katz and Alan B. Krueger, "The Rise and Nature of Alternative Work Arrangements in the United States, 1995-2015" (NBER Working Paper no. 22667, September 2016), http://nber.org/papers/w22667.
- 135. Lael Brainard, "The Gig Economy: Implications of the Growth of Contingent Work" (speech at the Evolution of Work conference, New York, November 17, 2016), http://bis.org/review/r161128d.htm.
- 136. Noam Scheiber, "Tax Law Offers a Carrot to Gig Workers. But It May Have Costs," New York Times, December 31, 2017, http://nytimes.com/2017/12/31/business /economy/tax-work.html; Shuyi Oei and Diane M. Ring, "The Senate Tax Bill and the Battles over Worker Classification," TaxProf (blog), November 11, 2017, http://taxprof.typepad.com/taxprof\_blog/2017/11/the-senate-tax-bill-and-worker-classification.html; Valerie Bolden-Barrett, "The Burgeoning Gig Economy Gets a Boost—From the New Tax Bill," HRDive, January 8, 2018, http://hrdive.com/news/the-burgeoning

 Endnotes	 11
Enumoies	11

- -gig-economy-gets-a-boost-from-the-new-tax-bill/514227.
- 137. Employer-provided health insurance in the United States was something of a historical accident. During World War II, the War Labor Board, responsible for overseeing wartime wage and price controls, ruled that fringe benefits such as health insurance and sick leave did not qualify as "wages" and thus were exempt from the restrictions. Employers facing labor shortage responded by offering more generous benefits packages. After the war, employer-sponsored coverage became the norm, with the number of Americans covered by employer health plans growing sevenfold by 1960.
- 138. Bureau of Labor Statistics, "Retirement Benefits: Access, Participation, and Take-up Rates," Employee Benefits Survey, March 2016, http://www.bls.gov/ncs/ebs/benefits/2016/ownership/private/table02a.htm.
- Bureau of Labor Statistics, "Table 6. Selected Paid Leave Benefits: Access," National Compensation Survey, March 2017, http://www.bls.gov/news.release/ebs2.t06.htm.
- 140. "OECD Indicators of Employment Protection," July 2013, OECD, http://oecd.org/employment/emp/oecdindicatorsofemploymentprotection.htm.
- 141. Board of Governors of the Federal Reserve System, Report on the Economic Well-Being of U.S. Households in 2016 (Washington, DC: Federal Reserve Board, 2017), http:// federalreserve.gov/publications/files/2016-report-economic-well-being-us -households-201705.pdf.
- 142. Diana Farrell and Fiona Greig, "The Monthly Stress-Test on Family Finances," JPMorgan Chase Institute Insight, March 2017, http://jpmorganchase.com/corporate/institute/insight-financial-stress-test.htm.
- 143. Sophie Quinton, "With the Growth of the Gig Economy, States Rethink How Workers Get Benefits," *Stateline* (blog), Pew Charitable Trusts, February 22, 2017, http://pewtrusts.org/en/research-and-analysis/blogs/stateline/2017/02/22 /with-growth-of-the-gig-economy-states-rethink-how-workers-get-benefits.
- 144. Nick Reisman, "Cuomo Plans Task Force to Assess 'Gig Economy' Benefits," State of Politics (blog), January 11, 2017, http://nystateofpolitics.com/2017/01 /cuomo-plans-task-force-to-assess-gig-economy-impact.
- 145. OECD Employment Outlook 2017, 84.
- 146. Gordon, The Rise and Fall of American Growth, 563.
- 147. Louis Nelson, "Trump at Davos: 'America Is Open for Business," *Politico*, January 26, 2018, http://politico.com/story/2018/01/26/trump-davos-speech-2018-370860.
- 148. The tax bill is estimated by the Congressional Budget Office to add nearly \$1.5 trillion to the federal budget deficit over the next decade. For background on the debt and deficit problem and the coming challenges for the United States, see Alden and Strauss, *How America Stacks Up*.
- 149. Economics & Statistics Administration, "Foreign Direct Investment in the United States: Update to 2013 Report," U.S. Department of Commerce, http://esa.gov /reports/foreign-direct-investment-united-states-update-2013-report.
- 150. Matthew Rees and Matthew Slaughter, "Slaughter & Rees Report: The Global Economy and Domestic Jobs," Tuck School of Business, http://tuck.dartmouth.edu

120 — Endnotes — — —
----------------------

- /news/articles/research-contradicts-notion-that-exporting-jobs-hurts-american-workers.
- 151. For Obama's investment statement, see White House Office of the Press Secretary, "Statement by the President on United States Commitment to Open Investment Policy," June 20, 2011, http://obamawhitehouse.archives.gov/the-press-office/2011/06/20 /statement-president-united-states-commitment-open-investment-policy.
- 152. Mihir Desai, "Breaking Down the New U.S. Corporate Tax Law," interview by Sarah Green Carmichael, December 26, 2017, *Harvard Business Review*, http://hbr.org/ideacast/2017/12/breaking-down-the-new-u-s-corporate-tax-law.
- 153. The administration's fiscal year 2019 budget proposes \$200 billion in new federal spending, half to be awarded through competitive grants. See Office of Management and Budget (OMB), "Efficient, Effective, Accountable: An American Budget," http://whitehouse.gov/wp-content/uploads/2018/02/budget-fy2019.pdf. The proposal has faced criticisms from some state and local officials who say it will offload more of the infrastructure burden on governments with fewer revenue sources. See Patrick Sisson, "Trump's Infrastructure Plan: Small Federal Investment, More State and Local Control," *Curbed*, February 12, 2018, http://curbed.com/2018/2/12/17003730/trump-infrastructure-plan-funding-road-congress.
- 154. John Wagner, "U.S. Chamber of Commerce to Push Trump, Congress to Raise the Gas Tax to Fund Infrastructure," *Washington Post*, January 16, 2018.
- OECD, Action Plan on Base Erosion and Profit Shifting (Paris: OECD Publishing, 2013), http://oecd.org/ctp/BEPSActionPlan.pdf.
- Jennifer Harris, "Writing New Rules for the U.S.-China Investment Relationship,"
   Council on Foreign Relations, December 2017, http://cfr.org/report/writing-new-rules
  -us-china-investment-relationship.
- 157. National Governors Association (NGA) Center for Best Practices, "Top Trends in State Economic Development," NGA, August 19, 2013, http://nga.org/files/live/sites/NGA /files/pdf/2013/1308TopTrendsinStateEconDevPaper.pdf; NGA Center for Best Practices, "Revisiting Top Trends in State Economic Development," NGA, March 2, 2016, http://nga.org/files/live/sites/NGA/files/pdf/2016/1603RevisitingTopTrends StateEcoDevelopment.pdf.
- 158. On Prosperity NOLA, see "About the New Orleans Business Alliance," New Orleans Business Alliance, http://nolaba.org/about; on Advance KC, see "Advance KC: A Strategic Blueprint for the City's Future," Advance KC, City of Kansas City, Missouri, http://kcmo.gov/advancekc; on Metro Phoenix, see "Metro Phoenix Global Investment Plan: The Global Cities Initiative, A Joint Project of Brookings and JPMorgan Chase," Greater Phoenix Economic Council, http://gpec.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/09/FDI-Plan-2017\_Plan-2.pdf.
- 159. Henry M. Cothran, Derek Farnsworth, and Jennifer L. Clark, "Business Retention and Expansion Programs: Why Existing Businesses Are Important," University of Florida IFAS Extension, 2006, http://edis.ifas.ufl.edu/pdffiles/FE/FE65100.pdf.
- 160. One example of this sort of planning is the Global Cities Initiative, a joint project of the Brookings Institution and JPMorgan Chase that is helping civic leaders in U.S. cities

 Endnotes	 121
Enunoies	1

- reorient their economies for better competitive success in global markets. See http://brookings.edu/project/global-cities.
- 161. Rodrick Miller, "The Tortoise and the Hare: Economic Competitiveness in the Amazon Era," FDI Alliance, December 2017, http://docs.wixstatic.com/ugd/a90217\_ bef9f493000c452f95da4f4db96376c2.pdf.
- 162. Nathan M. Jensen, "The Effect of Economic Development Incentives and Clawback Provisions on Job Creation: A Pre-registered Evaluation of Maryland and Virginia Programs," Research & Politics 4, no. 2 (June 2017), http://journals.sagepub.com/doi/full/10.1177/2053168017713646.
- Good Jobs First, "Model Legislation for Subsidy Reforms," October 10, 2012, http://goodjobsfirst.org/accountable-development/model-legislation.
- 164. Karen Mills and Chris Rudnicki, "How Companies Can Help Rebuild America's Common Resources," *Harvard Business Review*, September 21, 2015, http://hbr.org/2015/09/how-companies-can-help-rebuild-americas-common-resources.
- 165. "America's Community Banks Hope for Lighter Regulation," *Economist*, June 1, 2017, http://economist.com/news/finance-and-economics/21722893-other-challenges -include-technology-staff-retention-succession-planning-and-thin.
- Community Advisory Council and the Board of Governors, "Record of Meeting," November 2017, http://federalreserve.gov/aboutthefed/files/cac-20171103.pdf.
- 167. Johns Hopkins 21st Century Cities Initiative, "Financing Baltimore's Growth: Measuring Small Companies' Access to Capital," September 2017, http://21cc.jhu.edu/wp-content/uploads/2017/09/21cc-financing-baltimores-growth-sept-2017.pdf.
- 168. Dane Stangler and Jason Wiens, "The Economic Case for Welcoming Immigrant Entrepreneurs," Ewing Marion Kauffman Foundation, September 8, 2015, http://kauffman.org/what-we-do/resources/entrepreneurship-policy-digest/the-economic-case-for-welcoming-immigrant-entrepreneurs; Alexandra Starr, "Latino Immigrant Entrepreneurs: How to Capitalize on Their Economic Potential," Council on Foreign Relations, September 2012, http://cfr.org/report/latino-immigrant-entrepreneurs; Jason Wiens and Chris Jackson, "The Importance of Young Firms for Economic Growth," New American Economy, September 13, 2015, http://newamericaneconomy.org/issues/entrepreneurship.
- 169. Mark Warner, "Sens. Warner, Moran Reintroduce the Bipartisan Start Up Act," Press Release, September 29, 2017, http://warner.senate.gov/public/index.cfm /pressreleases?id=3F42A369-961C-4B4F-B6F4-DEA5BA28CCD8.
- 170. Dane Stangler and Jared Konczal, "Give Me Your Entrepreneurs, Your Innovators: Estimating the Impact of a Startup Visa," Ewing Marion Kauffman Foundation, February, 2013, http://kauffman.org/what-we-do/research/2013/02/give-me-your-entrepreneurs-your-innovators-estimating-employment-impact-of-a-startup-visa.
- 171. R&D Budget and Policy Program, "Historical Trends in Federal R&D," American Association for the Advancement of Science, September 2017, http://aaas.org/page/historical-trends-federal-rd#Overview; National Research Council, Rising to the Challenge: U.S. Innovation Policy for the Global Economy (Washington, DC: National Academies Press, 2012).

122	 Endnotes	
122	 Endnotes	

- 172. John F. Sargent Jr., "Federal Research and Development Funding FY2018,"
  Congressional Research Service, August 14, 2017, http://fas.org/sgp/crs/misc/R44888
  .pdf; Chris Mooney and Steven Mufson, "White House Seeks 72 Percent Cut to Clean
  Energy Research, Underscoring Administration's Preference for Fossil Fuels,"
  Washington Post, February 1, 2018, http://washingtonpost.com/business/economy
  /white-house-seeks-72-percent-cut-to-clean-energy-research-underscoring
  -administrations-preference-for-fossil-fuelsv/2018/01/31/c2c69350-05f3-11e8-b48c
  -b07fea957bd5\_story.html; Giorgia Guglielmi et al., "Trump Budget Gives Last-Minute
  Reprieve to Science Funding," Nature, February 12, 2018, http://nature.com/articles
  /d41586-018-01811-x.
- 173. "China May Match or Beat America in AI," *Economist*, July 15, 2017, http://economist.com/news/business/21725018-its-deep-pool-data-may-let-it-lead-artificial-intelligence-china-may-match-or-beat-america.
- 174. See Matt Hourihan, "If Government Scales Back Technology Research, Should We Expect Industry to Step In?" American Association for the Advancement of Science, October 16, 2017, http://mcmprodaaas.s3.amazonaws.com/s3fs-public/AAAS%20 Public%20%26%20Private%20R%26D.pdf.
- 175. Joe Kennedy and Robert D. Atkinson, "Why Expanding the R&D Tax Credit Is Key to Successful Corporate Tax Reform," Information Technology & Innovation Foundation, July 5, 2017, http://itif.org/publications/2017/07/05/why-expanding-rd-tax-credit-key-successful-corporate-tax-reform.
- U.S. Department of Commerce, Manufacturing USA Annual Report, 2016, http://manufacturingusa.com/sites/prod/files/Manufacturing%20USA-Annual%20 Report-FY%202016-web.pdf.
- 177. National Academies of Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine, Securing Advanced Manufacturing in the United States (Washington, DC: The National Academies Press, 2017), http://doi.org/10.17226/24875.
- 178. National Research Council Committee for Capitalizing on Science, Technology, and Innovation, An Assessment of the Small Business Innovation Research Program (Washington, DC: National Academies Press, 2008), http://ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/books/NBK23747.
- 179. Alden and Strauss, How America Stacks Up, 185.
- National Academies of Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine, Immigration Policy and the Search for Skilled Workers: Summary of a Workshop (Washington, DC: National Academies Press, 2015), http://doi.org/10.17226/20145.
- 181. The Stopping Trained in America PhDs from Leaving the Economy (STAPLE) Act, first introduced by then Representative Jeff Flake (R-AZ) in 2009, would provide a fast track to permanent residence for foreign students earning PhDs in the STEM fields at American universities. It has been reintroduced in subsequent Congresses.
- 182. The Trump administration has taken several steps to raise hurdles for U.S. companies trying to bring in foreign, college-educated workers on the H-1B visa, which allows eighty-five thousand foreign workers to enter the United States each year on renewable three-year visas. See Stuart Anderson, "Here's What to Expect on Immigration in 2018," Forbes, January 2, 2018, http://forbes.com/sites/stuartanderson/2018/01/02

 Endnotes	 12	3
Limitotos	1 4	

- /heres-what-to-expect-on-immigration-in-2018. A broader set of recommendations for attracting and retaining highly skilled immigrants can be found in Bush, McLarty, and Alden, U.S. Immigration Policy.
- 183. Grant Gross, "Microsoft Calls for \$5 Billion Investment in U.S. Education," Computerworld, September 27, 2012, http://computerworld.com/article/2491741 /technology-law-regulation/microsoft-calls-for--5b-investment-in-u-s--education.html.
- 184. Stephen Ezell, "ITIF Filing to USTR on Section 301 Investigation of China's Policies and Practices Related to Tech Transfer, IP, and Innovation," Information Technology& Innovation Foundation, October 25, 2017, http://itif.org/publications/2017/10/25/itif-filing-ustr-section-301-investigation-chinas-policies-and-practices.
- 185. Julie Wagner et al., "12 Principles Guiding Innovation Districts," Metropolitan Revolution Brookings, September 8, 2017, http://brookings.edu/blog /metropolitan-revolution/2017/09/08/12-principles-guiding-innovation-districts-2.
- 186. "Global Cities Initiative: A Joint Project of Brookings and JPMorgan Chase," Brookings Institution, August 18, 2017, http://brookings.edu/project/global-cities.
- 187. Michael Porter and Jan Rivkin, "Choosing the United States," *Harvard Business Review*, March 2012, http://hbr.org/2012/03/choosing-the-united-states.
- 188. Steve Holt, Periodic Payment of the Earned Income Tax Credit Revisited (Washington, DC: Brookings Institution, 2015), http://brookings.edu/research/periodic-payment-of-the-earned-income-tax-credit-revisited.
- 189. See Michael R. Strain, Getting Back to Work (Washington, DC: Conservative Reform Network, 2016), http://conservativereform.com/wp-content/uploads/2016/07/CRN\_Employment\_FINAL.pdf; Gene B. Sperling, "A Tax Proposal That Could Lift Millions Out of Poverty," Atlantic, October 17, 2017, http://theatlantic.com/business/archive/2017/10/eitc-for-all/542898.
- 190. Stanley Chrystal, "Beyond the Draft: Rethinking National Service," Aspen Institute, November 30, 2015, http://aspeninstitute.org/blog-posts/general-stanley-mcchrystal-beyond-draft-rethinking-national-service.
- Clive Belfield, The Economic Value of National Service (Washington, DC: The Franklin Project, Aspen Institute, 2013), http://assets.aspeninstitute.org/content/uploads/files/content/docs/pubs/FranklinProject\_EconomicValue\_final.pdf.
- 192. Alan Manning, "The Truth About the Minimum Wage," Foreign Affairs 97, no. 1 (January/February 2018).
- 193. Ekaterina Jardim, et al., "Minimum Wage Increases, Wages, and Low-Wage Employment: Evidence From Seattle" (NBER Working Paper no. 23532, National Bureau of Economic Research, June 2017), http://nber.org/papers/w23532; Rachel West, "Five Flaws in a New Analysis of Seattle's Minimum Wage," Center for American Progress, June 28, 2017, http://www.americanprogress.org/issues/poverty /news/2017/06/28/435220/five-flaws-new-analysis-seattles-minimum-wage; and "University of Washington Analysis of Seattle Minimum Wage Increase Is Fundamentally Flawed," Press Release, Economic Policy Institute, June 26, 2017, http://epi.org/press/university-of-washington-analysis-of-seattle-minimum-wage-increase -is-fundamentally-flawed.

124 — Endnotes — — —
----------------------

- 194. Cynthia Miller et al., Expanding the Earned Income Tax Credit for Workers Without Dependent Children (New York: MDRC, 2017), http://mdrc.org/publication/expanding-earned-income-tax-credit-workers-without-dependent-children.
- 195. "Rethinking the EITC," Center for Economic Progress, October 14, 2015, http://economicprogress.org/content/rethinking-eitc.
- 196. Bob Keener, "New Report: High-Road Business Practices Benefit Businesses and Society; Need Public Policy to Spread Adoption," American Sustainable Business Council, October 24, 2017, http://asbcouncil.org/news/press-release/new-report-high-road-business-practices-benefit-businesses-and-society; Zaynep Ton, The Good Jobs Strategy: How the Smartest Companies Invest in Employees to Lower Costs and Boost Profits (New York: New Harvest, 2014).
- 197. Larry Fink, "A Sense of Purpose: Larry Fink's Annual Letter to CEOs," BlackRock, January 2018, http://blackrock.com/corporate/en-no/investor-relations /larry-fink-ceo-letter.
- 198. Benefit Corporation, http://benefitcorp.net; James Surowiecki, "Companies With Benefits," New Yorker, August 4, 2014, http://newyorker.com/magazine/2014/08/04/companies-benefits.
- "The 2017 Distressed Communities Index," Economic Innovation Group, 2017, http://eig.org/dci.
- 200. "Globalisation Has Marginalised Many Regions in the Rich World," *Economist*, October 21, 2017, http://economist.com/news/briefing/21730406-what-can-be-done-help-them-globalisation-has-marginalised-many-regions-rich-world.
- 201. A. E. Challinor, "Canada's Immigration Policy: A Focus on Human Capital," Migration Policy Institute, September 15, 2011, http://migrationpolicy.org/article/canadas -immigration-policy-focus-human-capital.
- 202. "2016 Broadband Progress Report," Federal Communication Commission, January 29, 2016, http://fcc.gov/reports-research/reports/broadband-progress-reports/2016 -broadband-progress-report.
- 203. Marguerite Reardon, "How Blazing Internet Speeds Helped Chattanooga Shed Its Smokestack Past," CNET, August 20, 2015, http://cnet.com/news/how-blazing -internet-speeds-helped-chattanooga-shed-its-smokestack-past; Dominic Rushe, "Chattanooga's Gig: How One City's Super-Fast Internet Is Driving a Tech Boom," Guardian, August 30, 2014, http://theguardian.com/world/2014/aug/30 /chattanooga-gig-high-speed-internet-tech-boom.
- 204. Matias Busso and Patrick Kline, "Do Local Economic Development Programs Work? Evidence From the Federal Empowerment Zone Program," University of Michigan's National Poverty Center, November 28, 2007, http://eml.berkeley.edu//-pkline/papers/Busso-Kline%20EZ%20(web).pdf.
- 205. Bruce Bartlett, "Enterprise Zones: A Bipartisan Failure," Fiscal Times, January 10, 2014, http://thefiscaltimes.com/Columns/2014/01/10/Enterprise-Zones-Bipartisan-Failure; U.S. Government Accountability Office, "Revitalization Programs: Empowerment Zones, Enterprise Communities, and Renewal Communities," March 12, 2010, http://gao.gov/products/GAO-10-464R; Denis Teti, "An Idea Whose Time Never Came,"

Endantes	1 2
 crianoles	1.7

- Weekly Standard, January 15, 2016, http://weeklystandard.com/an-idea-whose-time-never-came/article/2000593.
- 206. "Opportunity Zones," Economic Innovation Group, February 4, 2017, http://eig.org/opportunityzones.
- 207. Concerns have been expressed, as with other programs that funnel capital into distressed areas such as the EB-5 investor program, that this provision could open tax loopholes subject to abuse. See, for example, Megan Schrader, "Opportunity Zones' in Tax Bill Ripe for Abuse," *Denver Post*, December 19, 2017, http://denverpost.com/2017/12/19/opportunity-zones-in-gop-tax-bill-ripe-for-abuse.
- 208. Manish Pandey and James Townsend, "Provincial Nominee Programs: An Evaluation of the Earnings and Retention Rates of Nominees" (Prairie Metropolis Centre Working Paper Series WP11-04, July 25, 2011); Colin McCann, Immigrant Entry to Smaller Urban Centres and Coordination with Local Labour Markets in Canada: Effects of the Provincial Nominee Program (PNP) (Ottawa: University of Ottawa, December 2014), http://ruor.uottawa.ca/handle/10393/32043.
- 209. Brandon Fuller and Sean Rust, "State-Based Visas: A Federalist Approach to Reforming U.S. Immigration Policy," CATO Institute, April 23, 2014, http://cato.org/publications/policy-analysis/state-based-visas-federalist-approach-reforming-us-immigration-policy.
- 210. Antoine van Agtmael and Alfred Bakker, *The Smartest Places on Earth: Why the Rustbelts Are the Emerging Hotspots of Global Innovation* (New York: Public Affairs, 2016).
- 211. "National Network: Connecting Learning and Work," http://nationalnetwork.org/about.
- 212. See Vivian Hunt et al., "Delivering Through Diversity," McKinsey Global Institute, January 2018, http://mckinsey.com/business-functions/organization/our-insights/delivering-through-diversity.
- 213. See Swiss-American Chamber of Commerce, "Jobs Now: Swiss-Style Vocational Education and Training: Voices for Companies, Governors and CEOs," http://www.ioe-emp.org/policy-areas/skills-and-education/skills-education-training-news-details/article/gan-releases-jobs-now-report-on-vocational-training-swiss-style.
- 214. Terri Bergman and Deborah Kobes, The State of Apprenticeship Among Workforce Boards (Washington, DC: National Association of Workforce Boards, 2017), http://jff.org/publications/state-apprenticeship-among-workforce-boards.
- 215. "Careers and Apprenticeships," AFL-CIO, March 31, 2017, http://aflcio.org/about/careers-and-apprenticeships.
- Robert Schwartz and Nancy Hoffman, "Pathways to Upward Mobility," National Affairs, Summer 2015, http://nationalaffairs.com/publications/detail /pathways-to-upward-mobility.
- 217. "Credential Registry," Credential Engine, March 20, 2017, http://credentialengine.org.
- 218. Brent Parton, *Youth Apprenticeship in America Today* (Washington, DC: New America Foundation, December 2017).
- $219. \ \ ``CareerWise Connects Education and Industry to Benefit Students and Businesses, ``CareerWise Colorado, September 2016, http://careerwisecolorado.org/about$

- -overview; "CareerWise Colorado Gets an A," *Denver Post*, September 19, 2016, http://denverpost.com/2016/09/19/careerwise-colorado-gets-an-a.
- 220. Pathways to Prosperity Initiative, http://jff.org/initiatives/pathways-prosperity -network. The program has also produced an initial detailed case study looking at the rollout in Delaware. See Robert Rothman, "Propelling College and Career Success: The Role of Strategic Partnerships in Scaling Delaware Pathways," Pathways to Prosperity, 2017. The initiative was modeled after research by the Harvard Graduate School of Education; William C. Symonds, Robert Schwartz, and Ronald F. Ferguson, "Pathways to Prosperity: Meeting the Challenge of Preparing Young Americans for the 21st Century," Pathways to Prosperity Project, Harvard University Graduate School of Education, 2011, http://dash.harvard.edu/handle/1/4740480. Further details on the initiative to date are in Nancy Hoffman and Robert B. Schwartz, Learning for Careers: The Pathways to Prosperity Network (Cambridge, MA: Harvard Education Press, 2017).
- 221. Angela Hanks and Ethan Gurwitz, "How States Are Expanding Apprenticeship," Center for American Progress, February 9, 2016, http://americanprogress.org/issues/economy/reports/2016/02/09/130750/how-states-are-expanding-apprenticeship; NGA, "State Strategies to Scale Quality Work-Based Learning," October 31, 2016, http://nga.org/cms/home/nga-center-for-best-practices/center-publications/page-ehsw-publications/col2-content/main-content-list/state-strategies-to-scale-qualit.html.
- 222. "Colorado Governor John Hickenlooper, the Markle Foundation, and 20 States Launch the Skillful State Network; Introduce Skillful State Playbook," *Business Wire*, February 14, 2018, http://businesswire.com/news/home/20180214005998/en /Colorado-Governor-John-Hickenlooper-Markle-Foundation-20.
- 223. "Activate Incentive Funds for Work-Based Learning at Your School," Colorado Succeeds, January 31, 2018, http://coloradosucceeds.org/what-we-do/lead-initiatives/workforce-readiness/incentives-industry-credentials.
- 224. "Manufacturing Day Infographic," MFG Day, October 12, 2017, http://mfgday.com.
- 225. Holzer and Baum, Making College Work.
- Organizations advocating universal computer science education in K-12 include the CSforAll Consortium (http://csforall.org/about) and Code.org (http://code.org).
- 227. Alastair Fitzpayne and Ethan Pollack, "A Changing Economy Requires a Renewed Focus on Lifelong Learning," Aspen Institute, July 5, 2017, http://aspeninstitute.org /blog-posts/a-changing-economy-requires-a-renewed-focus-on-lifelong-learning; Auta Main, Maine's Lifelong Learning Accounts Good News for Workers, Businesses, and the Economy (Boston: Federal Reserve Bank of Boston, 2008), http://maine.gov/labor/careerctr/docs/0908\_lila\_article.pdf; "Where Can Lifelong Learning Lead You?," Lifelong Learning Accounts, April 8, 2009, http://wtb.wa.gov/LifelongLearningAccount.asp.
- 228. Michael Mitchell et al., "A Lost Decade in Higher Education Funding: State Cuts Have Driven Up Tuition and Reduced Quality," Center on Budget and Policy Priorities, August 23, 2017, http://cbpp.org/research/state-budget-and-tax/a-lost-decade -in-higher-education-funding.
- 229. See Holzer and Baum, Making College Work.
- 230. Fitzpayne and Pollack, "A Changing Economy."



- 231. Edward Alden and Robert E. Litan, "A New Deal for the Twenty-First Century," Council on Foreign Relations, May 2017, http://cfr.org/report/new-deal-twenty-first-century.
- 232. James T. Austin et al., "Portable, Stackable Credentials: A New Education Model for Industry-Specific Career Pathways," McGraw-Hill Research Foundation, 2012, http:// jff.org/publications/portable-stackable-credentials-new-education-model -industry-specific-career-pathways.
- 233. Tim Kaine, "Kaine, Portman Introduce Bipartisan Jobs Act to Help Workers Access Training for In-Demand Career Fields," January 25, 2017, http://kaine.senate.gov/press-releases/kaine-portman-introduce-bipartisan-jobs-act-to-help-workers-access-training-for-in-demand-career-fields.
- 234. In addition to greater funding, the Trump administration says it is pursuing ways to expand apprenticeships in sectors where they remain rare, such as health care, information technology, and advanced manufacturing. See OMB, "Efficient, Effective, Accountable." The Obama administration supported two significant expansions of federal funding: \$175 million in competitive grant applications under the American Apprenticeship Program beginning in 2014, and the \$90 million expansion of grant funding passed by Congress in fiscal year 2016. See Benjamin Collins, "Apprenticeship in the United States: Frequently Asked Questions," Congressional Research Service, January 29, 2016. In its final fiscal year 2017 budget proposal, the Obama administration outlined a series of ambitious Job Driven Training Proposals, including \$2 billion to encourage state and local governments to increase employer participation in apprenticeships. See Department of Labor, "Budget in Brief Fiscal Year 2017," http://dol.gov/sites/default/files/documents/general/budget/FY2017BIB\_0.pdf.
- 235. Bruce D. Meyer et al., "Household Surveys in Crisis," Journal of Economic Perspectives 29, no. 4 (Fall 2015), http://aeaweb.org/articles?id=10.1257/jep.29.4.199; Nicholas Eberstadt et. al, "In Order That They Might Rest Their Arguments on Facts': The Vital Role of Government-Collected Data," Hamilton Project and American Enterprise Institute, March 2017, http://aei.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/03/THP\_GovDataFacts\_0317\_Fixed.pdf.
- 236. Chopra and Gurwitz, "Modernizing America's Workforce Data Architecture"; Chopra, interview.
- 237. Goldie Blumenstyk, "Education Department Now Plans a College-Rating System Minus the Ratings," *Chronicle of Higher Education*, June 25, 2015, http://chronicle.com/article/Education-Department-Now-Plans/231137.
- 238. College Scorecard, U.S. Department of Education, http://collegescorecard.ed.gov.
- 239. See Andrew Kreighbaum, "Push for 'Unit Records' Revived," Inside Higher Ed, May 16, 2017, http://insidehighered.com/news/2017/05/16/bipartisan-bill-would-overturn-federal-ban-student-unit-record-database; Mel Leonor, "Could Senate Higher Ed Rewrite Expand Data Collection?" Politico, February 6, 2018, http://politico.com/newsletters/morning-education/2018/02/06/could-senate-higher-ed-rewrite-expand-data-collection-094318.
- 240. Chopra and Gurwitz, "Modernizing America's Workforce Data Architecture."

128 — Endnotes — —
--------------------

- 241. Elisa Rassen et al., Using Labor Market Data to Improve Student Success (Washington, DC: Aspen Institute, 2014), http://aspeninstitute.org/publications/using-labor-market-data-improve-student-success.
- 242. Emilie Rusch, "New Colorado Jobs Program Aims to Help Middle-Skill Workers Get Ahead," *Denver Post*, March 17, 2016, http://denverpost.com/2016/03/17 /new-colorado-jobs-program-aims-to-help-middle-skill-workers-get-ahead.
- 243. OECD Employment Outlook 2017; World Trade Organization, World Trade Report 2017: Trade, Technology and Jobs (Geneva: World Trade Organization, 2017), http://wto.org/english/res\_e/booksp\_e/world\_trade\_report17\_e.pdf.
- 244. Michael Trebilcock and Sally Wong, "Trade, Technology and Transitions: Trampolines or Safety Nets for Displaced Workers?" (unpublished manuscript).
- 245. Anne Sylvaine Chassany, "Emmanuel Macron Pushes Through French Labour Law Reforms," *Financial Times*, September 22, 2017, http://ft.com/content/a9ad1728-9f68-11e7-9a86-4d5a475ba4c5.
- 246. Niklas Engbom, Enrica Detragiache, and Faezeh Raei, "The German Labor Market Reforms and Post-Unemployment Earnings," IMF Working Paper 15/162, July 2015, http://imf.org/external/pubs/ft/wp/2015/wp15162.pdf.
- National Skills Coalition, "Skills for Good Jobs: Agenda 2018," http:// nationalskillscoalition.org/resources/publications/file/Skills-for-Good-Jobs -Agenda-2018.pdf.
- 248. Conor McKay, Ethan Pollack, and Alistair Fitzpayne, "Modernizing Unemployment Insurance for the Changing Nature of Work," Aspen Institute Future of Work Initiative, January 2018.
- 249. Alden and Litan, "A New Deal for the Twenty-First Century."
- 250. For a review of the large literature on wage insurance, evidence from other countries, and suggestions for greater testing of its effectiveness, see Stephen Wandner, "Wage Insurance as a Policy Option in the United States," Upjohn Institute Working Paper, January 17, 2016.
- 251. Mihir Desai, "Move Americans to Jobs, Not the Other Way Around," *Bloomberg View*, August 28, 2017, http://bloomberg.com/view/articles/2017-08-28/move-americans-to-jobs-not-the-other-way-around.
- 252. The Aspen Institute, "A Resource Guide for College/Career Navigators or Those Interested in Starting a Navigator Program," November 2014, http://aspenwsi.org/wordpress/wp-content/uploads/CareerNavigators.pdf.
- 253. Claire Cain Miller and Quoctrung Bui, "Switching Careers Doesn't Have to Be Hard: Charting Jobs That Are Similar to Your Own," New York Times, July 27, 2017, http:// nytimes.com/2017/07/27/upshot/switching-careers-is-hard-it-doesnt-have-to-be.html.
- 254. Dick M. Carpenter II et al., License to Work: A National Study of Burdens from Occupational Licensing, 2nd ed. (Arlington, VA: Institute for Justice, 2017), http://ii.org/report/license-work-2.
- 255. Robert J. Thornton and Edward J. Timmons, "The De-licensing of Occupations in the United States," *Monthly Labor Review*, May 18, 2015, http://www.bls.gov/opub

E. J	1	
Endnotes	1	7

- /mlr/2015/article/the-de-licensing-of-occupations-in-the-united-states.htm.
- 256. National Conference of State Legislatures, Occupational Licensing: Assessing State Policy and Practice (Washington, DC: National Conference of State Legislatures, August 17, 2017), http://ncsl.org/portals/1/documents/labor/licensing/occupational\_licensing.pdf.
- 257. "TechHire," Opportunity@Work, Inc, http://opportunityatwork.org/techhire.
- 258. Andy Stern et al., Raising the Floor: How a Universal Basic Income Can Renew Our Economy and Rebuild the American Dream (Philadelphia: PublicAffairs, 2016).
- Charles Murray, In Our Hands: A Plan to End the Welfare State (Washington, DC: AEI Press, 2006).
- 260. "Realizing Human Potential in the Fourth Industrial Revolution: An Agenda for Leaders to Shape the Future of Education, Gender and Work," World Economic Forum, January 2017; OECD 2017 Employment Outlook.
- 261. Sebastian Schulze-Marmeling, "France: Occupational Personal Accounts Planned for 2017," EurWORK European Observatory of Working Life, November 30, 2015, http:// eurofound.europa.eu/observatories/eurwork/articles/labour-market /france-occupational-personal-accounts-planned-for-2017.
- 262. Nick Hanauer and David Rolf, "Shared Security, Shared Growth," *Democracy Journal*, June 1, 2015, http://democracyjournal.org/magazine/37/shared-security-shared-growth.
- 263. David Rolf et al, "Portable Benefits in the 21st Century," Aspen Institute, 2016, http://assets.aspeninstitute.org/content/uploads/files/content/upload/Portable\_Benefits\_final.pdf.
- 264. Sarah Kessler, "US Legislators Just Proposed a \$20-Million Experiment That Could Bring Benefits to Freelance and Gig-Economy Workers," *Quartz*, May 25, 2017, http://qz.com/991270/us-senator-mark-warner-proposed-a-20-million-fund-to-experiment -with-portable-benefits-for-freelancers-gig-economy-workers-and-contractors; Seth D. Harris and Alan B. Krueger, "A Proposal for Modernizing Labor Laws for Twenty-First Century Work: The 'Independent Worker,'" Hamilton Project, Brookings Institution, December 2015, http://brookings.edu/research/a-proposal-for-modernizing-labor -laws-for-21st-century-work-the-independent-worker.
- 265. "Why So Many Dutch People Work Part Time," *Economist*, May 12, 2015, http://economist.com/blogs/economist-explains/2015/05/economist-explains-12.
- 266. Rolf et al., "Portable Benefits."
- 267. Quinton, "With Growth of the Gig Economy."
- 268. Kyle James, "Nine Big Companies That Offer Benefits for Part-Time Workers," Christian Science Monitor, October 6, 2015, http://csmonitor.com/Business/Saving -Money/2015/1006/Nine-big-companies-that-offer-benefits-for-part-time-workers.
- 269. "Starbucks to Boost Pay, Benefits After U.S. Lowers Corporate Taxes," Reuters, January 24, 2018, http://reuters.com/article/us-starbucks-tax/starbucks-to-boost-pay-benefits-after-u-s-lowers-corporate-taxes-idUSKBN1FD1CD.
- 270. NGA Center for Best Practices, http://nga.org/cms/center; "U.S. Conference of Mayors

130	Endustes	
130	Enunoies	

- Business Council 2016 Best Practices Report," http://usmayors.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/03/bc2016.pdf.
- 271. Carnevale et al., Good Jobs That Pay Without a BA.
- 272. Glenn Marie-Lange, Quentin Wodon, and Kevin Carey, eds., *The Changing Wealth of Nations* 2018: *Building a Sustainable Future* (Washington, DC: World Bank, 2018), http://openknowledge.worldbank.org/handle/10986/29001.
- 273. "Baldrige Performance Excellence Program," National Institute of Standards and Technology, October 25, 2018, http://nist.gov/baldrige/how-baldrige-works/about -baldrige/baldrige-faqs.
- 274. John Holusha, "The Baldrige Badge of Courage—and Quality," New York Times, October 21, 1990, http://nytimes.com/1990/10/21/business/the-baldrige-badge-of-courage-and-quality.html.
- 275. HeroX, Tongal, XPrize, and MIT's Solve are all incentive challenge platforms designed to help organizations crowdsource problems and generate solutions through a competition. HeroX, Tongal, and XPrize all provide a monetary prize if the challenge generates a solution. See http://solve.mit.edu; http://www.herox.com; http://tongal.com; http://www.xprize.org.
- 276. On the priorities for the December 2018 G20 Summit, see "Overview of Argentina's G-20 Presidency 2018," http://g20.argentina.gob.ar/en/overview-argentinas-g20-presidency-2018.

Enduates	1	21
 ETIATIOLES		. D I